

### **MEETING AGENDA**

### MONO COUNTY ASSESSMENT APPEALS BOARD

Teleconference Only - No Physical Location

Regular Meeting

December 17, 2020 at 9:00 AM

### TELECONFERENCE INFORMATION

As authorized by Governor Newsom's Executive Order, N-29-20, dated March 17, 2020, the meeting will be held via teleconferencing with members of the Board attending from separate remote locations. This altered format is in observance of recommendations by local officials that precautions be taken, including social distancing, to address the threat of COVID-19.

### Important Notice to the Public Regarding COVID-19

Based on guidance from the California Department of Public Health and the California Governor's Officer, in order to minimize the spread of the COVID-19 virus, please note that there is no physical location of the meeting open to the public. You may participate in the Zoom Webinar, including listening to the meeting and providing public comment, by following the instructions below.

### To join the meeting by computer:

Visit

https://monocounty.zoom.us/j/96463343154?pwd=YktnaG5uUnk3eU4xYjk0QVZ5aUFMQT09

Passcode: 303148

Or visit <a href="https://www.zoom.us/">https://www.zoom.us/</a> click on "Join A Meeting" and use the Zoom Meeting ID 964 6334 3154, Passcode: 303148.

To provide public comment (at appropriate times), during the meeting, press the "Raise Hand" button on your screen.

### To join the meeting by telephone:

Dial (669) 900-6833, then enter Webinar ID: 964 6334 3154

Passcode: 303148. To provide public comment (at appropriate times) during the meeting, press \*9 to raise your hand.

**NOTE:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act if you need special assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact Helen Nunn, Clerk of the Board, at (760) 932-5530. Notification 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the County to make reasonable arrangements to ensure accessibility to this meeting (See 42 USCS 12132, 28CFR 35.130).

## PUBLIC MAY COMMENT ON AGENDA ITEMS AT THE TIME THE ITEM IS HEARD.

9:00 A.M. Call Meeting to Order

Pledge of Allegiance

# ADMINISTRATIVE BUSINESS 1. Approval of Minutes for August 20, 2020 Regular Meeting of Assessment Appeals Board

(Oster, Liebersbach, Mills)

Recommended Action: Approve minutes (Exhibit A). [20-12-01]

2. 2020 Assess Appeals Board Hearing/Meeting Calendar

Review of calendar and upcoming hearing dates.

### **HEARINGS**

3. Frank Family Trust Assessment Appeal Applications

(1) Parcel No. 022-300-069-000 AAB File No. 2019-013

Assessment Year: 2019-2020

Roll Value: 5,800,000 Stipulated Value: 5,000,000

Recommended Action: Take under submission the stipulation filed by the parties (Exhibit B); direct the parties to answer any

questions and provide any additional materials/documentation in support of the proposed stipulation; and either (i) approve stipulation and waive appearance of applicant or (ii) schedule appeal for hearing. [20-12-02]

(2) Parcel No. 022-300-069-000 AAB File No. 2018-009

Assessment Year: 2018-2019

Roll Value: \$6,481,329

Recommended Action: Direct the Chair to approve the withdrawal submitted by the applicant for File No. 2018-009 (Exhibit C). [20-

12-03]

### 4. West Coast Dental Consultants, Inc. Assessment Appeal Application

Parcel #860-000-200-000

File # 2019-001

Assessment Year: 2019-2020

Roll Value: \$242,100 Stipulated Value: \$222,100

Applicant has submitted a stipulation. In order for the Board to approve the stipulation at today's meeting, the applicant must waive Notice of Hearing, which was not provided 45 days prior to the hearing. Otherwise, this stipulation will be heard at a subsequent hearing.

Recommended Action: Take under submission the stipulation filed by the parties (Exhibit D); direct the parties to answer any questions and provide any additional materials/documentation in support of the proposed stipulation; and either (i) approve stipulation and waive appearance of applicant or (ii) schedule appeal for hearing. [20-12-03]

### **ADJOURN**

DRAFT MEETING MINUTES August 20, 2020 Page 1 of 4



### **DRAFT MEETING MINUTES**

# MONO COUNTY ASSESSMENT APPEALS BOARD ANNUAL BUSINESS MEETING

Teleconference Only - No Physical Location

Noticed Hearing and Meeting August 20, 2020 9:00 AM

9:02 A.M. Meeting called to order by Chair Oster.

Board Members Present: Brown, Liebersbach, Mills, and Oster. Board Members Absent: None.

All Board Members attended via teleconference. All votes were conducted by roll call.

### **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

1. Minutes of the Annual Business Meeting of the Assessment Appeals Board on July 20, 2020.

Review and approval of minutes of the annual business/administrative meeting of the Assessment Appeals Board held on July 20, 2020 (see Exhibit A).

Action: Approve minutes.

[20-08-01]

**Brown Moved; Liebersbach Seconded** 

Vote: 3 yes; 0 no

### **ADMINISTRATIVE BUSINESS**

DRAFT MEETING MINUTES August 20, 2020 Page 2 of 4

# 2. Proposed Amendments to the Mono County Assessment Appeals Board Local Rules

<u>Action</u>: Approved proposed amendments to Local Rules, as amended. [20-08-02]

Liebersbach Moved; Brown Seconded

Vote: 3 yes; 0 no

Liebersbach:

 Would like to amend language to say "The postponement can be initiated by submitting a written request to the Clerk or submitting the Hearing Confirmation letter with the appropriate box marked to request a postponement." See Exhibit B, page 3, first paragraph.

### 3. Update on Status of 2018 Horizon Air Assessment Appeals

Action: None.

### Jason Canger, Assistant County Counsel:

Provided update.

# 4. Update on Hearing and Consolidation of Frank Family Trust 09-29-08 Assessment Appeals

<u>Action</u>: Approve order consolidating 2018 and 2019 Frank Family Trust 09-29-08 appeals.

[20-08-03]

Liebersbach Moved; Brown Seconded

Vote: 3 yes; 0 no

### Jason Canger:

- Provided update on Frank Family Trust appeal.
- Consolidating 2018 and 2019 appeals.

### 5. Consolidation of Ormat et al. Assessment Appeal Applications

<u>Action</u>: Approve order consolidating 2018 and 2019 Ormat et al. assessment appeal applications with other Ormat et al appeals already under RTC 1604 waivers.

Mills Moved: Brown Seconded

Vote: 3 yes; 0 no

Liebersbach abstained from items 5 and 6. Recused self and left meeting. **Jason Canger:** 

- Assessor and Ormat submitted stipulations for 2014 and 2015 tax years.
- 2018 appeals will expire in November of this year.
- This item is to consolidate 2018 and 2019 with the previously filed appeals that are currently under waiver with the Board, to avoid the 2year limit expiring.

DRAFT MEETING MINUTES August 20, 2020 Page 3 of 4

### **HEARINGS**

### 6. Ormat et al Assessment Appeal Applications

<u>Action</u>: Accept and take under submission stipulations and withdrawals filed with the Board for the resolution of 2013-2019 Ormat et al appeals direct the parties to answer any questions and provide any additional materials/documentation in support of the proposed stipulations and withdrawals.

Mills Moved; Oster Seconded

Vote: 2 yes; 1 no Brown voted no.

### Jason Canger:

- Assessor and Ormat submit stipulations in previous years through 2018 – 2019 tax years.
- Ormat submitted withdrawals of other appeals that the parties did not address or did not feel were necessary.
- Board can approve stipulations or deny and set for hearing.

### **Aimee Brewster, Assistant Assessor:**

- Stipulated 2014-016.
- 12, 17, 18 and 19 have all been withdrawn.

Break: 9:29 AM

Reconvene: 10:30 AM

Board consensus to acknowledge and accept the information provided by Clerk

### Jason Canger:

Explained Rule 473 and the important of Geothermal to Mono County.

### Aimee Brewster:

- Not experts at valuing geothermal.
- Evaluated the previous assessment which was excellent.
- There is a reduction in value for 15-17 because the Assessor did not have all of the information available when he made the valuation.
- Not a base year value appeal it is a Prop. 8 appeal.

### Barry Beck, Assessor:

Does not have to d with 473, a temp reduction in value.

#### Brown:

Newly discovered reserves for years under appeal.

### **FXHIBIT A**

DRAFT MEETING MINUTES August 20, 2020 Page 4 of 4

- Asked the Assessor to provide a detailed written explanation of why Rule 473 doesn't apply to a Prop 8 reduction.
- Asked Ormat whether any appraisal report (whether for valuation/assessment purposes or not) on its real property/ improvements and geothermal reserves more recent than 2013 has been prepared. If so, can they provide a copy?
- Asked the parties whether there were newly-discovered reserves and/or depletions for the years under appeal.
- Asked the parties why the Board should approve a valuation based on the 2013 Ormat appraisal when it did not consider the value of geothermal reserves and expressly provided that it was not to be used for purposes other than for IRS reporting.

ADJOURNED at 11:05 A.M.	
ATTEST	
PAUL OSTER CHAIR OF THE BOARD	
SCHEEREEN DEDMAN CLERK OF THE BOARD	

BOE-305-S (P1) REV: 02 (07-15)

#### STIPULATION AGREEMENT

To be completed by the Assessor and filed with the Clerk of the Board at the address shown.



Assessment Appeals Board P.O. Box 237 Bridgeport, CA 93517-0237 Telephone: 760-932-5530

Fax: 760-932-5531

Email: skendall@mono.ca.gov

### **BEFORE THE COUNTY BOARD**

COUNTY OF	Mono	, STATE OF CALIFORNIA	
IN THE MATTER OF THE APPLICATION OF:		2019-013	
		APPLICATION NUMBER(S)	
Frank Family Trust		022-300-069-000	
NAME OF APPLICANT		PARCEL OR FILE NUMBER(S)	

### STIPULATION TO VALUE

For the Assessment Appeal Application referenced above, the applicant and the Assessor stipulate the following:

- 1. This stipulation agreement is made pursuant to Revenue and Taxation Code section 1607 and becomes effective only upon acceptance by the County Board.
- 2. The corrected assessed value of the property described in the application and enrolled upon the assessment roll for the year indicated shall be as hereafter set forth. The Assessor has reviewed the values and is now of the opinion that the full taxable value of the property, as of the lien date or event date (for change in ownership or new construction), should have been the values listed below as "Corrected Assessed Value."

ASSESSMENT YEAR  20 19 - 20 20  REGULAR SUPPLEMENTAL	ASSESSOR'S ROLL VALUE	APPLICANT'S OPINION OF VALUE	CORRECTED ASSESSED VALUE	DIFFERENCE (ROLL VALUE MINUS CORRECTED ASSESSED VALUE)
LAND	1,475,000	1,475,000	1,475,000	0
IMPROVEMENTS/ STRUCTURES	4,325,000	3,225,000	3,525,000	800,000
CROPS/TREES AND VINES				
MANUFACTURED HOME - PERSONAL PROPERTY				
FIXTURES				
PERSONAL PROPERTY				
TOTALS	5,800,000	4,700,000	5,000,000	800,000
PENALTY				

3. The facts upon which the change in assessed value is based are as follows:

This is a 2019 lien date appeal for a Proposition 8, decline in value. The subject property is a single family residence located on Pine Street in the Bluff subdivision of Mammoth Lakes. The subject has panoramic views of Mammoth Lakes and is highly unique in design, quality, and overall amenities. While a market does exist for the subject, there are few available participants. The comparable sales chosen are considered the best available as of the effective date of the appraisal.

The unadjusted sales within the market approach do not bracket the final value opinion of the subject. This is due to the subject being a super adequacy for its market whereby the use of sales of lessor similarity was unavoidable.

The subject has additional amenities which have not been considered in the market approach, such as a geothermal system, bullet proof walls, safe room, security doors, and hydronic heating. While it is likely that these items are desirable and have substantial value, the market data available is devoid of evidence for such adjustments. Most emphasis was placed on Comparable number one, which has the least overall gross and net adjustments. Comparable two and three are supportive. See attached for comparable sales.

The undersigned respectfully requests that the County Board accept the stipulation, waive the appearance of the applicant, and change the assessed value in accordance with Revenue and Taxation Code section 1610.8 and the California Constitution, Article XIII, section 16.

The applicant understands that in the event this stipulation agreement is not approved by the County Board prior to the time that taxes, or any portion thereof, become due, payment shall be made in accordance with the appropriate provisions of the Revenue and Taxation Code.

Further, applicant understands that the County Board may reject this stipulation agreement, and set or reset this application for hearing, pursuant to Revenue and Taxation Code section 1607.

I hereby stipulate to the values for the subject property, as stated in the "Corrected Assessed Value" section of this agreement. If the corrected value(s) is approved by the County Board, the stipulation agreement also constitutes a withdrawal of the Assessment Appeal Application.

SIGNATURE  David Baunwehl			EXECUTED 3/2020	
NAME OF AUTHORIZED SIGNER  David:Beumwohl		TITLE Att	orney	
FILING STATUS				
☐ OWNER ☐ AGENT ☐ ATTORNEY ☐ SPOUSE ☐ REGISTERED DOMEST	C PARTNER	CHILD	PARENT	PERSON AFFECTED
CALIFORNIA ATTORNEY, STATE BAR NUMBER: 93492		CORPOR	ATE OFFICER OF	R DESIGNATED EMPLOYEE
SIGNATURE OF COUNTY ASSESSOR  **Bacry, Back************************************	PRINT NAME Barry B	OF COUNTY ASS eck	SESSOR	
SIGNATURE OF COUNTY COUNSEL  Christian E. Milorich County One State County Coun	PRINT NAME OF COUNTY COUNSEL  Christian Milovich			
FOR COUNTY BOARD	USE ONL	Y		
The stipulation agreement is approved and appearance is waived. The with Revenue and Taxation Code section 1607.		•		nanged in accordance
The stipulation agreement is rejected, and the Assessment Appeal App	lication is se	for nearing	on:	DATE
ATTEST BY COUNTY BOARD:				
DATED:				
BY:				
CHAIRPERSON			CLERK OF TH	HE BOARD

### EXHIBIT B Appraisal Summary Sheet

1.00	Subject	Comparable 1		Comparable 2		Comparable 3	
Address	265 Pine Street	54 Bridges Lane		165 Pine Street		12 Old Juniper Lane	
APN	022-300-069-000	031-240-02	3-000	022-300-050-000		032-150-032-000	
Sale Date	1/1/19	7/18/18		6/27/18		11/16/18	
Sale Price		\$4,725,000		\$2,700,000		\$3,200,000	
\$/Sq. Ft.		\$691		\$590		\$591	
Location	The Bluffs	Greyhawk	(\$250,000)	The Bluffs		Juniper Ridge	(\$250,000)
Parcel Size	4.63/0.5+/- useable	0,31	\$250,000	0.37	\$250,000	0,27	\$250,000
View	Panoramic	Panoramic/Similar		Mountain	\$500,000	Mountain	\$500,000
Effective Year	2017	2011	\$30,000	2008	\$45,000	2004	\$65,000
Quality	D9.5D	D9.5D		D8.5D	\$825,000	D9,5D	
Square Feet	7,269	6,834	\$108,750	4,573	\$674,000	5,417	\$463,000
Bed/Bath	4/6,5	5/5.5	(\$20,000)	5/4,5		5/5,5	(\$20,000)
Mechanical/Storage	1196	90	\$82,950	0	\$89,700	139	\$79,275
Heating/Cooling	Hydronic	Hydronic		FAU		Hydronic	
Garage	2,045	569	\$110,700	824	\$91,575	648	\$104,775
Elevator	Yes	No	\$40,000	No	\$40,000	No	\$40,000
Covered Porch							
Uncovered Porch/Deck							
Condition	Excellent	Excellent		Excellent		Very Good	\$200,000
3.3-5-6-6-	Gross Adjustment:	\$892,400	18.89%	\$2,515,275	93.16%	\$1,972,050	61.63%
	Net Adjustment:	\$352,400	7.46%	\$2,515,275	93.16%	\$1,432,050	44.75%
	Adjusted Sale Price:	\$5,077,4	100	\$5,215	,275	\$4,632,050	

Concluded Value by the Sales Comparison Approach =

\$5,000,000

**EXHIBIT C** 

BOE-305-WD REV. 02 (07-15)

### **ASSESSMENT APPEAL WITHDRAWAL**

Mail or fax the completed form to the Clerk of the Board at the address shown.



Assessment Appeals Board P.O. Box 237 Bridgeport, CA 93517-0715 Telephone: 760-932-5530 Fax: 760-932-5531

Email: skendall@mono.ca.gov

### APPLICANT AND PROPERTY INFORMATION

NAME OF APPLICANT Frank Family Trust						HEARING DATE if applicable 12/17/2020	
MAILING ADDRESS OF APPLICANT (STREET ADDRESS OR P. O. BOX)  PO Box 2549  EMAIL ADDRESS							
CITY  Mammoth Lakes	STATE CA	ZIP CODE 93546	DAYTIME TELEPHONE	TIME TELEPHONE ALTERNATE TELEPHONE  ( )		FAX TELEPHONE	
I no longer wish to pursue an a that the Assessment Appeal Ap			property, or properties	, indicate	ed below and	hereby request	
APPLICATION NUMBER 2018-009 APPLICATION NUMBER			PARCEL, ACCOUNT OF	-000			
APPLICATION NUMBER			PARCEL, ACCOUNT O				
ADDITIONAL AFFECTED  An Assessment Appeal Application this request, unless the Assess the assessed value of the protection of the Assessor and applicant matter with the Assessor and application with the Assessor and application with the Assessor and application with the Assessor and applicant matter with the Assessor and Assesso	ation may be we sor has given a perty. Addition y have agreed onclude any fured to transact	ithdrawn at the applica nally, the co to withdraw orther action CER	any time prior to or at int a written notice of bunty Board can decive the appeal.  on the appeal. No contribution	the time an interde to renditional ove filing.  DATE 10/08,	e of the hearing to t	ng upon submission of nmend an increase in essment even though will be accepted.	
COMPANY NAME  Denvisi. SauBrawing weeth! APC				EMAIL AD	Attorney  MAIL ADDRESS  DANGE BAUNNON.CON		
FILING STATUS  ☐ OWNER ☐ AGENT ☐ ATTORNEY  ☑ CALIFORNIA ATTORNEY, STATE BAR I	_	REGISTER	RED DOMESTIC PARTNER	CHILD	PARENT	PERSON AFFECTED  DR DESIGNATED EMPLOYEE	
	FC	OR COUNT	Y BOARD USE ONLY				
☐ The withdrawal request is acc ☐ The withdrawal request is den will be notified of the date no I ☐ The withdrawal request is der proceed with an assessment r ATTEST BY COUNTY BOA  DATED:	ied. The Assess ess than 45 day ied by the appe eview to determ	or has delive s prior to the als board. In ine the full va	red a notice of increase. hearing date. accordance with section	Your app	the appeals be		
BY:CHAIRPERSO	N			·	CLERK OF	THE BOARD	

BOE-305-S (P1) REV. 02 (07-15)

#### STIPULATION AGREEMENT

To be completed by the Assessor and filed with the Clerk of the Board at the address shown.



Assessment Appeals Board P.O. Box 237 Bridgeport, CA 93517-0237 Telephone: 760-932-5530

Fax: 760-932-5531

Email: skendall@mono.ca.gov

#### **BEFORE THE COUNTY BOARD**

COUNTY OFMO	, STATE OF CALIFORNIA
IN THE MATTER OF THE APPLICATION OF:	2019-001
	APPLICATION NUMBER(S)
West Coast Dental Consultants, Inc.	860-000-200-000
NAME OF APPLICANT	PARCEL OR FILE NUMBER(S)

### STIPULATION TO VALUE

For the Assessment Appeal Application referenced above, the applicant and the Assessor stipulate the following:

- 1. This stipulation agreement is made pursuant to Revenue and Taxation Code section 1607 and becomes effective only upon acceptance by the County Board.
- 2. The corrected assessed value of the property described in the application and enrolled upon the assessment roll for the year indicated shall be as hereafter set forth. The Assessor has reviewed the values and is now of the opinion that the full taxable value of the property, as of the lien date or event date (for change in ownership or new construction), should have been the values listed below as "Corrected Assessed Value."

ASSESSMENT YEAR 20 19 - 20 20  REGULAR USUPPLEMENTAL	ASSESSOR'S ROLL VALUE	APPLICANT'S OPINION OF VALUE	CORRECTED ASSESSED VALUE	DIFFERENCE (ROLL VALUE MINUS CORRECTED ASSESSED VALUE)
LAND	57,100	50,000	57,100	0
IMPROVEMENTS/ STRUCTURES	185,000	100,000	165,000	20,000
CROPS/TREES AND VINES				
MANUFACTURED HOME - PERSONAL PROPERTY				
FIXTURES PERSONAL PROPERTY		114 221		
TOTALS	242,100	150,000	222,100	20,000
PENALTY				

THIS DOCUMENT IS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC INSPECTION

w

3. The facts upon which the change in assessed value is based are as follows:

This is a 2019 lien date appeal for a Proposition 8, decline in value. The subject property is a 2,400 square foot Hot Creek Hangar located at the Mammoth Yosemite Airport. The hangar is located on publicly owned land, which the taxpayer has an exclusive right to occupy. This right to occupy publicly owned land is subject to taxation and is known as a possessory interest. The land value represents the taxpayers right to occupy and is estimated by calculating the present worth of the future lease payments made to the Town of Mammoth Lakes for the land. The improvement value represents the hangar. A sales comparison approach to value was completed and based on our review of all available market data, a reduction for the 2019 lien date is warranted to reflect market value.

The undersigned respectfully requests that the County Board accept the stipulation, waive the appearance of the applicant, and change the assessed value in accordance with Revenue and Taxation Code section 1610.8 and the California Constitution, Article XIII, section 16.

The applicant understands that in the event this stipulation agreement is not approved by the County Board prior to the time that taxes, or any portion thereof, become due, payment shall be made in accordance with the appropriate provisions of the Revenue and Taxation Code.

Further, applicant understands that the County Board may reject this stipulation agreement, and set or reset this application for hearing, pursuant to Revenue and Taxation Code section 1607.

I hereby stipulate to the values for the subject property, as stated in the "Corrected Assessed Value" section of this agreement. If the corrected value(s) is approved by the County Board, the stipulation agreement also constitutes a withdrawal of the Assessment Appeal Application.

NAME OF AUTHORIZED SIGNER ROCLING BOY A	DATE EXECUTED  8/10/20  TITLE  RESIDENT
FILING STATUS OWNER   AGENT   ATTORNEY   SPOUSE	REGISTERED DOMESTIC PARTNER   CHILD   PARENT   PERSON AFFECTED
CALIFORNIA ATTORNEY, STATE BAR NUMBER.	CORPORATE OFFICER OR DESIGNATED EMPLOYEE
SIGNATURE OF COUNTY ASSESSOR	PRINT NAME OF COUNTY ASSESSOR Barry Beck
SIGNATURE OF COUNTY COUNSEL	PRINT NAME OF COUNTY COUNSEL  Christian Milovich
	FOR COUNTY BOARD USE ONLY
The stipulation agreement is approved and with Revenue and Taxation Code section 16	appearance is waived. The full value of the property in question is changed in accordance 607.
The stipulation agreement is rejected, and t	he Assessment Appeal Application is set for hearing on:
ATTEST BY COUNTY BOARD:	DATE
DATED:	
BY: CHAIRPERSON	CLERK OF THE BOARD

Appeal # 2019-001 APN # 860-000-2 860-000-200-000

Sale Date	APN	Adjusted Sale Price	Size	\$ Per Ft <sup>2</sup>	Class/ Type	Effective Year
01/01/19	Subject	\$165,000	2,400	\$68.75	Executive Hangar	2004
03/28/19	860-000-626-000	\$113,000	1,680	\$67.26	Executive Hangar	2006
03/25/19	860-000-504-000	\$129,000	2,016	\$63.99	Town Hangar	1994
03/15/19	860-000-312-000	\$200,000	3,360	\$59.52	Corp 1	2000
09/28/18	860-000-581-000	\$235,000	3,360	\$69.94	Corporate 1	2002
09/04/18	860-000-613-000	\$230,000	3,360	\$68.45	Corporate 1	2002
09/04/18	860-000-739-000	\$115,000	1,680	\$68.45	Executive 1	2002
03/02/18	860-000-354-000	\$95,000	1,688	\$56.28	Town Hangar	1989